Quantifying Changes to Infaunal Communities Associated with Several Deep-Sea Coral Habitats in the Gulf of Mexico and Their Potential Recovery from the *Deepwater Horizon* **Oil Spill**

Quantifying Changes to Infaunal Communities Associated with Several Deep-Sea Coral Habitats in the Gulf of Mexico and Their Potential Recovery from the *Deepwater Horizon* **Oil Spill**

Authors

Jill R. Bourque Amanda W.J. Demopoulos

Prepared under US Geological Survey Outer Continental Shelf Funding by US Geological Survey Wetland and Aquatic Research Center 7920 NW 71st Street Gainesville, FL 32653

Published by

U.S. Department of the Interior Bureau of Ocean Energy Management Gulf of Mexico OCS Region

New Orleans, LA June 2019

DISCLAIMER

This report has been technically reviewed by BOEM, and it has been approved for publication. The views and conclusions contained in this document are those of the authors and should not be interpreted as representing the opinions or policies of BOEM, nor does mention of trade names or commercial products constitute endorsement or recommendation for use.

REPORT AVAILABILITY

To download a PDF file of this report, go to the US Department of the Interior, Bureau of Ocean Energy Management Data and Information Systems webpage [\(http://www.boem.gov/Environmental-Studies-](http://www.boem.gov/Environmental-Studies-EnvData/)[EnvData/\)](http://www.boem.gov/Environmental-Studies-EnvData/), click on the link for the Environmental Studies Program Information System (ESPIS), and search on OCS Study BOEM 2019-033.

The report is also available at the National Technical Reports Library at [https://ntrl.ntis.gov/NTRL/.](https://ntrl.ntis.gov/NTRL/) The contact information is below.

> U.S. Department of Commerce National Technical Information Service 5301 Shawnee Rd. Springfield, Virginia 22312 Phone: (703) 605-6000, 1(800)553-6847 Fax: (703) 605-6900 Website:<http://www.ntis.gov/>

CITATION

Bourque, JR, Demopoulos, AWJ. 2019. Quantifying changes to infaunal communities associated with several deep-sea coral habitats in the Gulf of Mexico and their potential recovery from the *Deepwater Horizon* oil spill. New Orleans (LA): US Department of the Interior, Bureau of Ocean Energy Management. Study No.: OCS Study BOEM 2019-033.

ABOUT THE COVER

Left: Impacted coral at MC294. Right: Non-impacted coral at MC203. Photo credits: Oceaneering *Millennium* ROV, 2011.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors thank Charles Fisher and Erik Cordes and their labs, the ECOGIG consortium, the Ocean Exploration Trust, the crews of the R/V *Atlantis*, *Holiday Chouest*, E/V *Nautilus*, R/V *Falkor*, DSV *Ocean Inspector*, HOV *Alvin*, ROV *Millennium*, ROV *Hercules*, and ROV *Global Explorer*. Additional thanks to the USGS Benthic Ecology Group for assistance at sea, sample sorting, and thoughtful discussions during the preparation of this report.

Contents

List of Figures

List of Tables

List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

1 Introduction

1.1 Background

1.1.1 Deep Gulf of Mexico and Deep-Sea Corals

Extensive information is available about infaunal soft-sediment communities in the Gulf of Mexico (Gulf) (Pequegnat et al. 1990, Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009, Wei et al. 2010), particularly from the large-scale sampling effort of the Deep Gulf of Mexico Benthos (DGOMB) project in the early 2000s (Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009). Infaunal soft-sediment communities in the northern Gulf differ by geographic location and depth (Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009, Wei et al. 2010). Density decreases with depth, while taxa diversity exhibits a mid-depth (1,100-1,300 m) maximum (Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009). Community composition is influenced by both geographic location and depth, with zones (as defined by Wei et al. 2010) encompassing specific depth ranges, ranging from 635 to 3,314 m, and separated into east and west components. These zones were correlated to detrital particulate organic carbon (POC) export flux, primarily from the Mississippi River (Wei et al. 2010), where POC flux decreases with depth (Biggs et al. 2008). The flux of POC has also been found to be higher in the northeast Gulf than the northwest (Biggs et al. 2008), and consequently, biomass of infaunal communities is positively correlated with sediment organic carbon content (Morse and Beazley 2008).

Most of the deep Gulf is composed of soft-sediment environments, but the relative flat seafloor is punctuated in areas with other heterogeneous habitats, including chemosynthetic environments and deepsea coral habitats. Deep-sea corals create a complex three-dimensional structure that enhances local biodiversity, supporting diverse and abundant fish and invertebrate communities (Mortensen et al. 1995, Costello et al. 2005, Henry and Roberts 2007, Ross and Quattrini 2007, Buhl-Mortensen et al. 2010). In recent years, knowledge of the sphere of influence of deep-sea corals has expanded, with evidence that coral habitats also influence surrounding sediments (Mienis et al. 2012, Demopoulos et al. 2014, Fisher et al. 2014, Demopoulos et al. 2016, Bourque and Demopoulos 2018). Deep-sea corals are capable of altering their associated biotic and abiotic environment, thus serving as ecosystem engineers (e.g., Jones et al. 1994). The depositional environment and associated hydrodynamic regime around coral habitats differ from the extensive expanses of soft-sediments that dominate the sea floor (e.g., Mienis et al. 2009a. 2009a, Mienis et al. 2009b, Mienis et al. 2012), with the three-dimensional structure of the coral causing turbulent flows that enhance sediment accumulation adjacent to coral structures. In the northern Gulf, deep-sea corals generally occur on mounds of authigenic carbonate (Schroeder 2002) where elevation above the benthic boundary layer into higher velocity laminar flows allows for increased availability of food resources (Buhl-Mortensen and Mortensen 2005). The different hydrodynamics around corals likely affects the sediment geochemistry and in turn infaunal community structure and function (Demopoulos et al. 2014).

Ecosystem-based research on Gulf infaunal communities has primarily focused on soft-sediment environments. Initial research on deep-sea coral-associated infaunal communities focused on *Lophelia pertusa* (e.g., Demopoulos et al. 2014), and more recent studies focused on octocorals (Fisher et al. 2014, Demopoulos et al. 2016, Bourque and Demopoulos 2018) and comparisons among coral habitat types (Bourque and Demopoulos 2018). Coral-adjacent sediment communities are distinctly different from nearby background soft-sediment (Demopoulos et al. 2014, Bourque and Demopoulos 2018), with a sphere of influence estimated to be between 14 and 100 m (Demopoulos et al. 2014, Bourque and Demopoulos 2018). The coral type (e.g., *L. pertusa*, *Madrepora oculata*, octocorals) also influences

sediment communities, with *L. pertusa* habitats distinct from both *M. oculata* and octocoral habitats (Bourque and Demopoulos 2018). Differences among coral communities are influenced by depth, location, and sediment organic content (Bourque and Demopoulos 2018), and the reef size and the amount of habitat complexity are potential factors (Demopoulos et al. 2014, Bourque and Demopoulos 2018). Fisher et al. (2014) also demonstrated that infaunal communities adjacent to individual colonies and multiple mixed species of octocorals also differ from infauna in northern Gulf non-coral soft sediments (Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009, Wei et al. 2010). Patterns in coral-associated communities are decoupled from the general depth relationships established for soft-sediment habitats in the Gulf (Wei et al. 2010), exhibiting a mid-depth (~800 m) maximum in density and no relationship with diversity (Bourque and Demopoulos 2018). These differences suggest additional local-scale processes (e.g., nearbottom currents affecting grain size, food availability, and larval dispersal) are driving infaunal community patterns across the Gulf region as a whole (Wei et al. 2010). Complex hydrodynamic environments around deep-sea corals may substantially alter sediment organic matter deposition (Mienis et al. 2009, Mienis et al. 2009, Mienis et al. 2012) and the typical depth/diversity relationship may be decoupled as a result of patchiness in sediment organic carbon content around deep-sea corals.

1.1.2 The *Deepwater Horizon* **Oil Spill and Effects on Deep Sea Benthos**

In April 2010, a blowout occurred at the *Deepwater Horizon* Macondo well site at 1,525 m depth, releasing approximately 3.19×10^6 barrels (134 million gallons; 507 million liters) of oil into the northern Gulf until it was capped in July 2010 (USA v. BP et al. 2015). Oil was present as surface sheens and a deep-water plume (Camilli et al. 2010) that deposited over a large area of the seafloor (Valentine et al. 2014, Chanton et al. 2015). The release of the dispersant Corexit® further dispersed oil into the hydrographically-stratified water column, limiting transport into surface waters and retaining oil particles at depth (Camilli et al. 2010, Valentine et al. 2014, White et al. 2014).

The spill impacts were widespread, but it was unclear how the deep-sea benthic communities were affected. Characterization of the sediment macrofaunal communities $(>300 \mu m)$ is a well-established approach to tracking changes to impacted coastal and deep-sea communities worldwide (Gray et al. 1990, Hyland et al. 1999, Dean 2008, Manoukian et al. 2010). Sediment macrofauna are important components of benthic biodiversity, providing essential ecosystem functions, including transfer of energy, sediment bioturbation and stabilization, and organic matter decomposition (Gage and Tyler 1991, Danovaro et al. 2008, Gray and Elliott 2009, Thurber et al. 2014). They represent important indicators of oil-spill disturbance primarily due to their sedentary lifestyle, relatively rapid response to change, and sensitivity to ecological disturbances such as hydrocarbon contamination and organic enrichment (Pearson and Rosenberg 1978, Gray et al. 1979, Gray et al. 1990, Montagna and Harper Jr. 1996). Specific taxa are frequently used as pollution indicators, including the polychaete families Capitellidae, Cirratulidae, and Spionidae, which can rapidly colonize substrates and have a high tolerance to oil exposure (Gomez Gesteira et al. 2003, Dean 2008) and Amphipoda (Crustacea), which are sensitive to oil exposure (Gesteira and Dauvin 2000, Grant and Briggs 2002). By examining these communities and monitoring them over time, we can estimate the magnitude of impact and their ability to recover following disturbance.

Initial impacts from the *Deepwater Horizon* oil spill have been observed in both soft-sediment and coralassociated macrofaunal communities (Montagna et al. 2013, Fisher et al. 2014, Demopoulos et al. 2016, Montagna et al. 2016, Qu et al. 2016). The spatial extent of impact to soft-sediment infauna was estimated to be 172 km^2 in an area (Montagna et al. 2013) that corresponded to the estimated shape and extent of the deep-water plume (Camilli et al. 2010). High and moderate impacts were documented within 3 to 17 km from the wellhead, with communities exhibiting decreased macrofaunal and meiofaunal diversity corresponding to high concentrations of hydrocarbons and barium (Montagna et al. 2013). Impacts to

coral-associated sediments were documented at three sites (MC297, MC294, MC344) all within 22 km of the wellhead (Fisher et al. 2014, Demopoulos et al. 2016). Impacts were site specific; high hydrocarbon concentrations were associated with low macrofaunal density and diversity similar to a toxicity event (MC294), and high macrofaunal density and low diversity similar to an organic enrichment event (MC297), and high variability within all communities.

Temporal change in impacted deep-sea communities has been assessed over short time frames (one year) in soft-sediment (Montagna et al. 2016) and coral habitats (Fisher et al. 2014) and in reference to historical data (Qu et al. 2016). Overall declines in macrofaunal abundance and diversity of polychaete assemblages were documented near the wellhead (Qu et al. 2016), as compared to historical data (Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009, Wei et al. 2010, Carvalho et al. 2013). Between 2010 and 2011, Montagna et al. (2016) observed continued depression of macrofaunal diversity and taxa richness, but an increase in macrofaunal density in impacted zones, as compared to non-impacted areas with similar hydrocarbon concentrations in the sediments. Overall, Montagna et al. (2016) estimated that recovery of impacted deep-sea sediments would be on the scale of decades or longer. In contrast, Fisher et al. (2014) documented a reduction in hydrocarbon concentrations, albeit still higher than background sediments, at a single impacted coral site (MC294) between 2010 and 2011, with a decrease in macrofaunal density. The post-spill temporal studies (Fisher et al. 2014, Montagna et al. 2016) used comparable collection methods in both years, but collection methods of historical samples differed in the use of box cores (Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009, Wei et al. 2010, Carvalho et al. 2013), which are known to underestimate macrofaunal densities (Montagna et al. 2017). Use of consistent methods across studies or normalization of data from disparate methods is also important considerations for quantitatively assessing temporal change in the deep sea.

Though these multi-year studies have produced important baseline data, we lack information about the long-term impact of the *Deepwater Horizon* oil spill on benthic infaunal communities, particularly for impacted and injured deep-sea coral habitats, which are necessary for impact assessments, informing the development of future restoration plans and delineation of protected areas, and guiding long-term monitoring programs of deep-sea environments. Monitoring benthic infaunal communities will yield important insights into the patterns and trajectory of change within these ecosystems by identifying their sensitivity and resiliency to disturbance. As industry moves into deeper water, questions remain about impacts to deep-sea ecosystems. Therefore, it is imperative that monitoring efforts effectively identify and differentiate impacts from oil and gas activities from other forms of disturbance, including hurricanes and climate change.

1.2 Objectives

The primary objective was to document temporal change in deep-sea coral sediment community structure in order to track long-term responses to anthropogenic disturbance as compared to natural variability. Specifically, we assessed changes in benthic infaunal communities following the *Deepwater Horizon* oil spill at several deep-sea coral sites located in proximity to the well head and at reference, non-impacted sites between 2010 and 2016. To provide the appropriate context for assessing temporal change in postspill communities, we assessed the potential differences between sediment communities associated with different coral habitats (e.g., octocorals, *L. pertusa*, *M. oculata*), as well as pre- and post-spill time-series samples at sites not within the vicinity of the oil spill. Last, pre- and post-spill coral-associated communities were compared to additional Gulf deep-sea habitats, including chemosynthetic seeps, shipwrecks, and soft-sediments that represent current baseline conditions in the deep Gulf from which to establish long-term monitoring studies.

2 Methods

2.1 Study Locations

Between 2010 and 2016, sediments were collected adjacent to deep-sea coral habitats at three impacted sites and two non-impacted sites in the northern Gulf (Figure 1; Table A-1). Detailed information on the site discovery, selection, and impact designation can be found in White et al. (2012), Fisher et al. (2014), and Demopoulos et al. (2016). Previous studies of deep-sea sediments in the Gulf were assessed in reference to impacted sites (Table A-1), including additional reference, non-impacted deep-sea coral habitats (263–1,095 m; Demopoulos et al. 2014, Demopoulos et al. 2016, Bourque and Demopoulos 2018), three chemosynthetic seep sites (1,400–2,384 m; Brooks et al. 2014), seven shipwreck sites (532– 2,270 m; Demopoulos et al. 2017), and 45 soft-sediment communities from DGOMB (213–3,528 m; Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009). Site names correspond to Bureau of Ocean Energy Management (BOEM) Lease Block designations. Three types of reference coral habitats were included in analyses based on the dominant coral type at a given location: *L. pertusa* (Lophelia), *M. oculata* (Madrepora), and octocoral (Octocoral), where the primary octocoral taxa was either a single or mixed species of *Paramuricea*, *Callogorgia*, *Paragorgia* and/or *Chrysogorgia*.

Figure 1. Map of study locations in the Gulf of Mexico

Different colored circles represent sampling locations at impacted sites (Fisher et al. 2014, Demopoulos et al. 2016), non-impacted reference sites (Demopoulos et al. 2016, Bourque and Demopoulos 2018), other deep-sea coral reference sites (Bourque and Demopoulos 2018), Lophelia pertusa sites (Demopoulos et al. 2014), chemosynthetic seep habitats (Brooks et al. 2014), shipwrecks (Demopoulos et al. 2017), and soft-sediments (Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009). The black star represents the site of the *Deepwater Horizon* oil spill at MC252.

2.2 Sample Collection and Processing

Sediment samples were collected between 2010 and 2016 on seven cruises in the Gulf (Table A-1). Push cores (6.35 cm diameter) were collected adjacent to coral habitats (within 1 m) using a remotely-operated vehicle (ROV) or a human-occupied vehicle (HOV). After recovery, all sediment cores were sectioned vertically (either 0–1, 1–3, 3–5, 5–10 cm or 0–2, 2–5, 5–10 cm). Data for impacted and non-impacted octocoral sites in 2011 were published in Demopoulos et al. (2016) and Fisher et al. (2014) (see Appendix 1). Data for cores collected at AT357 2013–2014 were published in Bourque and Demopoulos (2018). Temporal dynamics of sediment communities pre- and post-spill were assessed at one octocoral site– (GB299) and two *L. pertusa* sites (VK906 and VK826), with data published in Bourque and Demopoulos (2018). Sediment core sections processed for infauna analysis were preserved whole in an 8–10% buffered formalin solution until they were returned to the laboratory where they were stained with rose bengal and washed through a 300-µm sieve to retain the macrofauna. Macrofauna were sorted with a dissecting microscope and identified to the lowest practical taxonomic level, including family level for polychaetes, peracarid crustaceans, and aplacophorans. Surface sediment sections (0–1 and 0–2 cm) from cores for geochemistry analysis were frozen whole at -20 °C until they were returned to the lab. Grain size analysis was performed using the Folk method (Folk 1974). Sediment subsamples were homogenized prior to drying at 50–60 °C and acidified with 1.0 N phosphoric acid before weighing into tin boats. These samples were analyzed for organic carbon content and stable carbon isotope composition referenced to Vienna PeeDee Belemnite. Analyses were conducted at Washington State University using a Costech (Valencia, USA) elemental analyzer interfaced with a GV Instruments (Manchester, UK) IsoPrimeTM isotope ratio mass spectrometer.

2.3 Data Analysis

To assess the natural variability in coral sediment communities pre- and post-spill, infaunal communities at one octocoral site and two *L. pertusa* sites were investigated. Temporal dynamics of infaunal community parameters were assessed at three impacted sites, MC297, MC294, and MC344, and two nonimpacted reference sites, MC036 and AT357. Macrofaunal density and univariate measures of biodiversity among years sampled were analyzed using one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) followed by post-hoc test Tukey's Honest Squares Difference (HSD) for multiple comparisons. All data were tested for normality and heteroscedasticity using Shapiro-Wilk and Levene's test (Zar 1999) and log*e*transformed when necessary. If transformation did not achieve normality or heteroscedasticity, a nonparametric Kruskal-Wallis test was used on univariate measures followed by a pairwise Wilcox test with a Holm correction for multiple comparisons. A significance level of $p < 0.05$ was used in all tests. Univariate statistics were computed with the program R (R Development Core Team 2016). Diversity was examined using the Shannon-Wiener diversity index (H'loge) and taxa evenness (Pielou's J'), based on untransformed abundance data using DIVERSE in PRIMER Statistical Software version 7 (Clarke and Gorley 2015).

Community structure was assessed by examining the overall contribution of higher level taxa, including Polychaeta, Oligochaeta, Crustacea, Mollusca, and other taxa. Other taxa included Halacaridae, Callipallenidae, Cnidaria (Anthozoa, Hydrozoa), Echinodermata (Holothuroidea, Ophiuroidea), Nemertea, Urochordata, Chaetognatha, Sipuncula, Echiura, and Turbellaria. Colonial taxa (i.e., Porifera, Bryozoa, Octocorallia) were not included in abundance, diversity, and community analyses but were included in overall taxa numbers. Multivariate analysis of community structure across cores was performed on square-root transformed abundance data using Bray-Curtis similarities in PRIMER version 7 (Clarke and Gorley 2015). Differences were examined using one-way and two-way analysis of similarity (ANOSIM). Similarity of percentages (SIMPER) was used to identify the taxa responsible for

discriminating between communities and to assess the variability within communities. A subset of the multivariate communities at impacted and non-impacted sites were assessed in conjunction with geographic location (latitude, longitude), sample year, bathymetric position (depth), sediment grain size (mud content), sediment organic carbon content, and stable carbon isotope composition ($\delta^{13}C$) using distance-based linear modelling (DISTLM) and distance-based redundancy analysis (dbRDA) using the PERMANOVA+ add on package to PRIMER 7 (Anderson et al. 2008) for locations where all of these data were available. DISTLM performs nominal tests of each variable's explanatory power on community structure and builds a multivariate statistical model of explanatory power of a suite of variables when considered together to determine the "best" model based on the Akaike information criterion for small sample sizes (AICc).

3 Results

3.1 Pre- and Post-Spill Communities

3.1.1 Octocoral Habitats

Only one octocoral site, GB299, was sampled both pre- and post-spill in 2009 and 2010. Macrofaunal density was similar between 2009 and 2010 (Table 1; One-way ANOVA, $F_{1,11}=1.39$, p=0.26), as was Shannon diversity (Table 1; One-way ANOVA, $F_{1,11}=0.90$, $p=0.36$) and taxa evenness (Table 1; One-way ANOVA, $F_{1,11}=0.00$, p=0.99). There was also no significant difference in community structure between 2009 and 2010 (Figure 2, Figure 3; One-way ANOSIM, R=0.007, p=0.48), with both years dominated by polychaetes (63-68%).

Table 1. Density and Diversity at Sites Sampled Both Pre- and Post-Spill

Octocoral sites includes GB299; *L. pertusa* sites include VK906 and VK826. Number in parentheses indicates one standard error.

Figure 3. Non-metric multidimensional scaling of octocoral communities at GB299 collected in 2009 and 2010.

Based on Bray-Curtis similarities of square-root transformed abundance data.

3.1.2 *Lophelia pertusa* **Habitats**

Two *L. pertusa* sites were sampled pre-spill in 2009 and post-spill in 2011. Macrofaunal densities were similar between 2009 and 2011 (Table 1; One-way ANOVA, $F_{1,24}=0.63$, p=0.43) as was taxa evenness (Table 1; One-way ANOVA, $F_{1,24}=2.72$, p=0.11). Shannon diversity was significantly higher in 2011 than in 2009 (Table 1; One-way ANOVA, F1,24=4.41, p=0.046). *Lophelia pertusa* communities were also significantly different between 2009 and 2011 (Figure 4, Figure 5; One-way ANOSIM, R=0.13, p=0.041), with differences due to higher densities of the polychaetes Oweniidae and Maldanidae in 2009, but higher densities of Gastropoda (Mollusca) and Oligochaeta in 2011 (17.3% of dissimilarity).

Figure 4. Percent taxonomic composition of macrofaunal abundance of *Lophelia pertusa* **communities at VK906 and VK826 in 2009 and 2011.**

Figure 5. Non-metric multidimensional scaling of *Lophelia pertusa* **communities at VK906 and VK826 in 2009 and 2011.**

Based on Bray-Curtis similarities of square-root transformed abundance data.

3.2 Post-Spill Temporal Change in Non-Impacted Communities

There was no significant correlation of macrofaunal density and sample year at the non-impacted sites (Spearman correlation, ρ=0.037, p=0.83). Mean macrofaunal density was highest in 2015 (Figure 6; $18,062 \pm 5,963$ individuals m⁻²) and lowest in 2014 (6,973 \pm 1,691 individuals m⁻²); however, there was no significant difference among years (One-way ANOVA, F4,31=2.23, p=0.088).

Figure 6. Macrofaunal density at non-impacted sites post-spill. Error bars represent one standard error.

There was a significant correlation of Shannon diversity and sample year (Figure 7; Spearman correlation, $p=-0.55$, $p=0.0006$) with Shannon diversity decreasing with time. Shannon diversity varied among years at non-impacted sites (Figure 7; One-way ANOVA, F4,31=4.73, p=0.004) with 2011 significantly higher than 2015 (Tukey HSD, p=0.003), while all other pairwise comparisons were non-significant. In contrast, there was no correlation of taxa evenness with sample year (Spearman correlation, $p=-0.32$, $p=0.061$), but evenness varied between years (Figure 8; Kruskal test, χ 2=11.73, p=0.019), with taxa evenness significantly higher in 2011 than 2016 (Wilcox test, p=0.047).

Figure 8. Taxa evenness (Pielou's J') of non-impacted sites post-spill. Error bars represent one standard error.

Overall taxa composition varied between years at non-impacted sites (Figure 9). Polychaetes dominated communities in 2011–2014 (43–58%), while crustaceans dominated communities in 2015 and 2016 (42– 53%). Multivariate community structure at non-impacted sites varied between years (Figure 10; Two-way ANOSIM, $R=0.24$, $p=0.0004$) and between sites (Two-way ANOSIM, $R=0.47$, $p=0.001$). However, the only significant pairwise comparisons were 2011 with 2014 and 2011 with 2016 (R>0.38, p<0.01) and were due to higher densities of oligochaetes, bivalves, Tanaellidae tanaids, and Syllidae polychaetes in 2011 than in 2014 (17.7% dissimilarity) but lower densities of Desmosomatidae isopods, Tanaid sp. B, and Dorvilleidae polychaetes than in 2016 (17.2% dissimilarity).

Figure 9. Percent taxonomic composition of macrofaunal abundance of non-impacted sites postspill.

Figure 10. Non-metric multidimensional scaling of non-impacted communities post-spill. Based on Bray-Curtis similarities of square-root transformed abundance data.

3.3 Temporal Change in Impacted Communities

Macrofaunal density at the three impacted sites (MC297, MC294, and MC344) decreased over time since the spill (Figure 11; Pearson correlation = -0.31, p=0.002, R^2 =0.096). Mean density was highest immediately after the spill in 2010 (19,905 \pm 2,754 individuals m⁻²) and lowest in 2015 (8,741 \pm 1,821 individuals $m²$), with 2010 significantly higher than 2013, 2014, and 2015 (Tukey HSD, p<0.029) and 2012 significantly higher than 2015 (Tukey HSD, p=0.042).

Figure 11. Macrofaunal density at impacted sites post-spill. Error bars represent one standard error.

Diversity has remained stable over time. There was no significant correlation of Shannon diversity or taxa evenness with sample year (Spearman correlation: Shannon diversity $p=0.113$, $p=0.27$; evenness $p=0.103$, $p=0.33$) and no significant difference among years (Figure 12; One-way ANOVA, $F_{6,87}=1.98$, $p=0.078$). However, taxa evenness did vary among years (Figure 13; One-way ANOVA, $F_{6,87}=3.43$, $p=0.004$, with 2010 significantly lower than all other years sampled (Tukey HSD, $p<0.042$).

Figure 12. Shannon diversity (H'log*e***) at impacted sites post-spill.** Error bars represent one standard error.

Figure 13. Taxa evenness (Pielou's J') at impacted sites post-spill. Error bars represent one standard error.

Overall infaunal composition (Figure 14) varied among years, with 2010 being the most distinct with the highest proportions of polychaetes (84%), while the proportion of polychaetes for all other years ranged from 56 to 70%. In contrast, 2010 had the lowest proportion of crustaceans (4.6%) and molluscs (4.8%), while all other years ranged from 13 to 21% for crustacea and 14 to 21% for molluscs. Multivariate community structure also varied among years (Figure 15; Two-way ANOSIM, R=0.208, p=0.00002) as well as among sites (Two-way ANOSIM, R=0.444, p=0.00001), with communities in 2010 significantly different from all other years except 2012 (R>0.19, p<0.048). Macrofaunal communities from 2010 were dissimilar from other years due to higher densities of Dorvilleidae, Capitellidae, and Cirratulidae polychaetes and lower densities of Paraonidae polychaetes; those four taxa accounted for 25 to 31% of the dissimilarity between years. Pairwise comparisons also indicated that the only years that did not differ from one another were 2011 with 2012, 2014, and 2015 (R>0.058, p>0.12), and 2012 with 2014 (R=0.14, p=0.13). However, the first year post-spill (2010) and the most recently sampled year (2016) were still significantly different $(R=0.214, p=0.006)$.

Figure 14. Percent taxonomic composition of macrofaunal abundance at impacted sites post-spill.

Figure 15. Non-metric multidimensional scaling of impacted communities post-spill. Based on Bray-Curtis similarities of square-root transformed abundance data.

3.4 Impacted and Non-Impacted Communities

Macrofaunal density did not differ between impacted and non-impacted communities within years sampled (One-way ANOVA, p>0.05). In contrast, Shannon diversity was significantly lower in 2011 at impacted sites than non-impacted sites (One-way ANOVA, $F_{1,32}=4.38$, $p=0.044$) but the remaining years were similar. Taxa evenness was also similar between impacted and non-impacted sites within years (One-way ANOVA, p>0.07). Multivariate analysis of community assemblages yielded differences between impacted and non-impacted sediments even after accounting for variability among years (Figure 16; Two-way ANOSIM: Impact R=0.287, p=0.00001).

Figure 16. Non-metric multidimensional scaling of impacted and non-impacted communities postspill.

Based on Bray-Curtis similarities of square-root transformed abundance data.

3.5 Environmental Variables

Various geochemical analyses were performed on surface sediment sections (0–1 or 0–2 cm, depending on the sample) from both the impacted and non-impacted sites. Sediment grain size at impacted sites contained high proportions of mud for all years sampled (Figure 17; >97%). In contrast, non-impacted sites had lower mud content (73–93%) and higher sand (6-18%) and gravel (1–20%) content. Organic carbon content was highest in 2011 at impacted sites (Figure 18; 1.50 \pm 0.1%) and significantly decreased over time (Spearman correlation, $ρ = -0.57$, $p=0.008$). At non-impacted sites, organic carbon content was also highest in 2011 (1.29 \pm 0.2%), but there was no correlation with time (Spearman correlation, $\rho = -$ 0.43, p=0.24). Stable carbon isotope composition also decreased over time at impacted sites (Figure 19; Spearman correlation, $\rho = -0.45$, p=0.048), but not at non-impacted sites (Spearman correlation, $\rho = -0.19$, $p=0.62$). Overall, the $\delta^{13}C$ was higher at impacted sites than non-impacted sites.

Figure 17. Sediment grain size composition of surface sediment at impacted and non-impacted sites post-spill.

Error bars represent one standard error.

Figure 19. Sediment stable carbon isotopic composition (δ13C) of surface sediment at impacted and non-impacted sites post-spill.

Error bars represent one standard error.

DISTLM analysis indicated that all variables except organic carbon content and sample year could individually explain a significant portion of the variation in impacted and non-impacted communities (Table 2), with mud content providing the best individual explanation (11.4%, p=0.014). The "best" model included mud content, depth, and δ^{13} C, explaining 28.4% of the variation in impacted and nonimpacted communities (Table 3; Figure 20). However, 15 additional models were within 1 AICc unit of the "best" model, with the five-variable model of mud content, latitude, longitude, depth, and $\delta^{13}C$ explaining 40.2% of the community variation.

Table 2. DISTLM Results of Environmental Variables for Impacted and Non-impacted Sites Postspill

SS(trace)= quantitative partition of the total sum of squares for each variable; Pseudo-F= F statistic; P= p-value of the Pseudo-F statistic; Proportion= proportion of the community variation explained by the individual variable.

Table 3. DISTLM Results of "Best" Models of Environmental Variables for Impacted and Nonimpacted Post-spill Sites

 R^2 proportion of community variation explained by the model; RSS=residual sum of squares; No.Vars= number of variables in the model.

Figure 20. dbRDA of the "best" model of environmental variables explaining impacted and nonimpacted communities post-spill.

Based on Bray-Curtis similarities of square-root transformed abundance data. Axis dbRDA1 accounts for 42.4% of the fitted and 12% of the total variation, and axis dbRDA2 accounts for 36.1% of the fitted and 10.3% of the total variation.

3.6 Comparisons to Other Gulf of Mexico Habitats

Coral-associated sediment communities, whether they were from impacted or non-impacted sites, were distinct from other habitat types in the Gulf, including chemosynthetic seeps, shipwrecks, and softsediments (Figure 21; One-way ANOSIM, R>0.365, p<0.0004). Impacted communities were most similar to the nearby non-impacted communities $(R=0.187, p=0.0003)$ and reference coral communities $(R=0.306, p=0.00001)$, but differed significantly from soft-sediment communities $(R=0.799, p=0.00001)$.

Figure 21. Non-metric multidimensional scaling of multiple deep-sea habitats in the Gulf of Mexico.

Based on Bray-Curtis similarities of square-root transformed abundance data. Impacted sites include MC294, MC297, and MC344. Non-impacted sites include MC036 and AT357. Reference corals and *Lophelia pertusa* cores from Bourque and Demopoulos (2018); Shipwreck cores from Demopoulos et al. (2017); Seep cores from Brooks et al. (2014); DGOMB cores from Rowe and Kennicutt II (2009).

4 Discussion

4.1 Pre-spill and Post-spill Reference Communities

Although little information was available on pre-spill coral infaunal communities, temporal dynamics preand post-spill in healthy coral communities differed for octocorals and *L. pertusa* habitats. There was no change in either the univariate metrics (e.g., density, diversity) or community structure between the prespill and post-spill samples at the reference octocoral site, but there was a difference in evenness and community structure at the *L. pertusa* sites. Despite the significant difference in *L. pertusa* communities between time points, the small R value (see 3.1.2) suggests the overall difference was small, and all *L. pertusa* communities clustered together when compared to all other Gulf habitats (Figure 21). There are several potential reasons for the different temporal dynamics at these two habitats. First, infaunal communities at *L. pertusa* and octocoral habitats are known to differ in the Gulf, with higher sediment organic content and coarse-grained sediments (Bourque and Demopoulos 2018), thus year-to-year change might also be dissimilar, as observed. Second, the time span between sampling points at *L. pertusa* habitats (2 years) was greater than for the octocoral habitat (1 year), which might account for the higher dissimilarity at *L. pertusa* communities. Additional time-series sampling at undisturbed reference coral locations of multiple coral types would help define long-term (>2 years) natural temporal change in Gulf coral communities.

The observed stability in communities at the octocoral site suggests that in areas not impacted by the *Deepwater Horizon* spill, there was little temporal change in coral-associated sediment communities in the year just before and just after the spill. In the absence of disturbance events, temporal variability of macrofauna in the deep sea is expected to be low, with change often structured by seasonal fluctuations of surface productivity export to the sea floor (e.g., Tyler 1988). However, the location of the octocoral site, GB299, may provide limited insights into temporal dynamics at the deeper impacted sites. Both coral and soft-sediment communities vary in the Gulf based on depth and location (Wei et al. 2010, Bourque and Demopoulos 2018), and GB299 is 397 kilometers from the spill site at MC252 and at least 384 kilometers from the impacted sites. Additionally, GB299 occurs at a depth of 355 m, far shallower than the 1,300 m of the shallowest impacted site. The impacted sites are also at deeper depths $(>1,300 \text{ m})$ than previously investigated coral infaunal communities $\langle 1,100 \text{ m}$; Bourque and Demopoulos 2018) and the natural patterns in community structure (e.g., density, diversity) at these depths has yet to be established. However, the deep sea is a relatively stable environment, such that we might expect community variability would decrease at increased depths. Therefore, communities examined at GB299 provide a conservative baseline estimate for variability at the deep impacted sites. The lack of pre-spill information of communities near the wellhead highlights the importance of this pre- and post-spill baseline information to provide context for detailed post-spill analysis of communities of impacted and nonimpacted sites.

4.2 Temporal Change at Impacted Sites and Non-impacted Sites

Patterns in community parameters (e.g., density, diversity, community structure) differed between impacted and non-impacted sites, suggesting different environmental controls on these communities. Density was highest at the impacted sites immediately after the spill; however, this was only at a single impacted site. The initial high density and low diversity suggests an organic enrichment response, with communities dominated by tolerant taxa (Fisher et al. 2014). The decline in density from 2010 to 2011

suggests an overall toxicity response that was not immediate, likely related to continued deposition of hydrocarbons from the deep-water plume over time, with densities remaining low through 2015. In contrast, macrofaunal density did not change over time at the non-impacted sites, suggesting an overall stability in natural communities in the years following the spill, consistent with our results from the healthy coral habitat at GB299. Diversity patterns also differed between impacted and non-impacted communities, with diversity decreasing over time at non-impacted sites, but no overall change at impacted sites. Community structure differed among years for both impacted and non-impacted sites, but again, the pattern of change differed. At the impacted sites, most years differed from each other, another indication of a constantly changing community. In contrast, community differences at the non-impacted sites were determined by a difference between 2011 with 2014 and 2016, suggesting that there are longer-term natural changes occurring in reference coral habitats that persist over time.

Multiple factors influenced the community dynamics at impacted and non-impacted sites post-spill. Consistent with previous studies (e.g., Demopoulos et al. 2014, Demopoulos et al. 2016, Bourque and Demopoulos 2018), sampling location, which also corresponded to depth differences, is a significant factor in structuring communities accounting for a larger difference than between years. The DISTLM analysis indicated that depth, percent mud content, and stable carbon isotope composition are the specific site parameters structuring communities. Depth has previously been identified as a structuring agent on Gulf coral communities (Bourque and Demopoulos 2018), and the effect of depth may confound our results, as depth is unique for the impacted sites, with all non-impacted sites occurring at shallower depths. Additional samples from non-impacted coral sites at similar depths as the impacted sites would allow for an estimation of the overall effect of depth on coral sediment communities. Mud content was also higher at impacted sites than non-impacted sites, possibly due to increased sedimentation of finegrained material from the *Deepwater Horizon* blowout in proximity to the wellhead. The higher proportion of sand and gravel-sized sediments at non-impacted sites are likely the result of the multiple coral types present at AT357, including the scleractinian *M. oculata*, which is prone to breakage providing a source of large grain sizes to adjacent sediments. Lastly, the $\delta^{13}C$ values were lower at nonimpacted sites as compared to impacted sites, suggesting different carbon sources. Many of the coral sites also contain natural hydrocarbon seeps (e.g., MC344, AT357), with high concentrations of hydrocarbons in subsurface sediment (5-10 cm; Fisher et al. 2014) as compared to surface sediments which might account for the different isotopic composition. Variable deposition of fresh material from surface productivity to the seafloor may also account for the different sediment δ^{13} C values between impacted and non-impacted sites, where fresh organic matter is enriched in ¹³C relative to sediments associated with hydrocarbon seeps (Demopoulos et al. 2010). Overall, differences in the local sediment environment between impacted and non-impacted sites continued to persist over time, influencing the associated infaunal communities.

Because only a few other studies have documented temporal changes in *Deepwater Horizon*-affected benthic communities post-spill (Fisher et al. 2014, Montagna et al. 2016, Qu et al. 2016), comparisons are limited for coral-associated sediment communities. High hydrocarbon concentrations documented at the impacted sites in 2011 by Fisher et al. (2014) are consistent with the results of Montagna et al. (2016), indicating a regional deposition of hydrocarbons near the wellhead. However, macrofaunal community metrics at impacted coral sites differed from impacted soft-sediments, which had increases in both density and diversity between 2010 and 2011 (Montagna et al. 2016). Although sampling effort in 2010 for coral communities was limited, the difference in community response between soft-sediments and coral communities suggest different recovery trajectories for these environments, which can only be determined by additional sampling of soft-sediments post-spill. Given the different depositional environment surrounding deep-sea corals (e.g., Mienis et al. 2009, Mienis et al. 2009, Mienis et al. 2012), the initial supply and concentration of hydrocarbons following the spill may have differed for coral habitats and was likely patchy in nature (Valentine et al. 2014), resulting in high concentrations at farther distances from the wellhead than for soft-sediment habitats (Montagna et al. 2013, Fisher et al. 2014). Once deposited, hydrocarbons are broken down by microbial processes and slowly buried by natural sediment deposition. Natural sediment deposition rates in the Gulf are low (Yeager et al. 2004), suggesting burial of hydrocarbons will be slow. The continued high levels of hydrocarbons at MC294 (Fisher et al., 2014) is consistent with the results of Montagna et al. (2016), who suggest that hydrocarbon concentrations would continue to remain above background levels for many years. Continued high levels of hydrocarbons, combined with potentially low burial rates, would enable long-term exposure of infaunal taxa to hydrocarbons, possibly resulting in the continual decline in macrofaunal density at the impacted coral sites.

4.3 Other Habitats in the Gulf of Mexico

Because the pre-spill community baseline was unknown at any of the impacted sites, it is unclear what a recovered community at these sites should resemble. However, our results indicate that impacted communities continued to change seven years post-spill, while communities at non-impacted sites exhibited few changes. Compared to other types of benthic habitats in the Gulf (e.g., chemosynthetic seeps, *L. pertusa*, shipwrecks, soft-sediments), impacted communities most closely resemble reference and non-impacted coral communities. Coral communities continue to differ from historical Gulf softsediment environments irrespective of their location (Rowe and Kennicutt II 2009), consistent with previous work (Demopoulos et al. 2014, Fisher et al. 2014), highlighting the importance of these unique communities to the biodiversity of the Gulf region as a whole. Thus, monitoring changes in non-impacted habitats provides the baseline data and metrics needed for documenting response and quantifying recovery at impacted sites.

Loss of benthos following a disturbance event like the *Deepwater Horizon* spill has broader ecological impacts because benthic fauna provide important ecosystem services, including organic matter decomposition, bioturbation and stabilization of sediments, and transfer of energy to higher trophic levels (Danovaro et al. 2008). As coral sediments differ from the vast soft sediments of the Gulf with individual sites isolated from one another, the magnitude of impact is likely greater than for soft-sediments as recovery will be determined in part by recruitment and succession. With multiple unique taxa occurring in deep-sea coral sediments, loss of biodiversity may be greater because macrofauna often have limited dispersal ranges. In addition, because the corals themselves have been injured at many of these sites, we have yet to determine how a change in the local physical habitat heterogeneity may contribute to recovery trajectories.

5 References

- Anderson M, Gorley RN, Clarke KR. 2008. PERMANOVA+ for PRIMER: Guide to software and statistical methods. Plymouth (GB) PRIMER-E Ltd.
- Biggs DC, Hu C, Muller-Karger FE. 2008. Remotely sensed sea-surface chlorophyll and POC flux at deep Gulf of Mexico benthos sampling stations. Deep Sea Res Part II. 55: 2555-2562.
- Bourque JR, Demopoulos AWJ. 2018. The influence of different deep-sea coral habitats on sediment macrofaunal community structure and function. PeerJ. 6: e5276.
- Brooks JM, Fisher C, Roberts H, Bernard B, MacDonald I, et al. (TDI-Brooks, International, College Station, TX). 2014. Investigations of chemosynthetic communities on the lower continental slope of the Gulf of Mexico. Volume I: Final Report and Volume II: Appendices. New Orleans, LA, U.S. Department of the Interior, Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, Gulf of Mexico OCS Region. Report Nos.: OCS Study BOEM 2014-650 and BOEM 2014-651. Contract No.: M05PC00018
- Buhl-Mortensen L, Mortensen PB. 2005. Distribution and diversity of species associated with deep-sea gorgonian corals off Atlantic Canada. In: Freiwald A, Roberts JM, editors. Cold-water corals and ecosystems. Berlin, Springer-Verlag. p. 849–879.
- Buhl-Mortensen L, Vanreusel A, Gooday AJ, Levin LA, Preide IG, et al. 2010. Biological structures as a source of habitat heterogeneity and biodiversity on the deep ocean margins. Mar Ecol. 31(1): 21-50.
- Camilli R, Reddy CM, Yoerger DR, Van Mooy BAS, Jakuba MV, et al. 2010. Tracking hydrocarbon plume transport and biodegradation at Deepwater Horizon. Science. 330(6001): 201-204.
- Carvalho R, Wei C-L, Rowe G, Schulze A. 2013. Complex depth-related patterns in taxonomic and functional diversity of polychaetes in the Gulf of Mexico. Deep Sea Res I. 80(0): 66-77.
- Chanton, J, Zhao T, Rosenheim BE, Joye S, Bosman S, et al. 2015. Using natural abundance radiocarbon to trace the flux of petrocarbon to the seafloor following the Deepwater Horizon oil spill. Environ Sci Technol. 49(2): 847-854.
- Clarke KR, Gorley RN. 2015. PRIMER v7: User manual/Tutorial. Plymouth (UK): PRIMER-E.
- Costello M, McCrea M, Freiwald A, Lundälv T, Jonsson L, et al. 2005. Role of cold-water *Lophelia pertusa* coral reefs as fish habitat in the NE Atlantic. In: Freiwalk A, Roberts JM, editors. Cold-water corals and ecosystems. Berlin (DE): Springer-Verlag. p. 771-805.
- Danovaro R, Gambi C, Dell'Anno A, Corinaidesi C, Fraschetti S, et al. 2008. Exponential decline of deep-sea ecosystem functioning linked to benthic biodiversity loss. Curr Biol. 18(1): 1-8.
- Dean HK. 2008. The use of polychaetes (Annelida) as indicator species of marine pollution: A review. Intl J Trop Biol. 56(4): 11-38.
- Demopoulos AWJ, Bourque JR, Cordes E, Stamler KM. 2016. Impacts of the Deepwater Horizon oil spill on deep-sea coral-associated sediment communities. Mar Ecol Prog Ser. 561: 51-68.
- Demopoulos AWJ, Bourque JR, Frometa J. 2014. Biodiversity and community composition of sediment macrofauna associated with deep-sea *Lophelia pertusa* habitats in the Gulf of Mexico. Deep Sea Res Part I. 93: 91-103.
- Demopoulos AWJ, Gualtieri D, Kovacs K. 2010. Food-web structure of seep sediment macrobenthos from the Gulf of Mexico. Deep Sea Res Part II. 57(21–23): 1972-1981.
- Demopoulos AWJ, Ross SW, Kellogg CA, Morrison CL, Nizinsku MS, et al. 2017. Deepwater Program: Lophelia II, continuing ecological research on deep-sea corals and deep-reef habitats in the Gulf of Mexico. Report No.: Open-File Report 2017-1139. Reston(VA): U.S. Geologic Survey.
- Fisher CR, Demopoulos AWJ, Cordes EE, Baums IB, White HK, et al. 2014. Coral communities as indicators of ecosystem-level impacts of the Deepwater Horizon Spill. BioSci. 64(9): 796-807.
- Folk RL. 1974. Petrology of sediment rocks. Austin (TX): Hemphill Publishing Company.
- Gage JD, Tyler PA. 1991. Deep-sea biology: A natural history of organisms at the deep-sea floor. Cambridge (GB): Cambridge University Press.
- Gesteira JLG, Dauvin JC. 2000. Amphipods are good bioindicators of the impact of oil spills on softbottom macrobenthic communities. Mar Pollut Bull. 40(11): 1017-1027.
- Gomez Gesteira JL, Dauvin JC, Salvande Fraga M. 2003. Taxonomic level for assessing oil spill effects on soft-bottom sublittoral benthic communities. Mar Pollut Bull. 46(5): 562-572.
- Grant A, Briggs AD. 2002. Toxicity of sediments from around a North Sea oil platform: are metals or hydrocarbons responsible for ecological impacts? Mar Environ Res. 53(1): 95-116.
- Gray JS, Clarke KR, Warwick RM, Hobbs G. 1990. Detection of initial effects of pollution on marine benthos: an example from the Ekofisk and Eldfisk oilfields, North Sea. Mar Ecol Prog Ser. 66: 285- 299.
- Gray JS, Elliott M. 2009. Ecology of marine sediments: From science to management. Oxford (GB): Oxford University Press.
- Gray JS, Waldichuk M, Newton AJ, Berry RJ, Holden AV, et al. 1979. Pollution-induced changes in populations [and discussion]. Philos Trans Royal Soc. 286(1015): 545-561.
- Henry L, Roberts JM. 2007. Biodiversity and ecological composition of macrobenthos on cold- water coral mounds and adjacent off-mound habitat in the bathyal Porcupine Seabight, NE Atlantic. Deep-Sea Res I. 54: 654-672.
- Hyland JL, Van Dolah RF, Snoots TR. 1999. Predicting stress in benthic communities of southeastern US estuaries in relation to chemical contamination of sediments. Environ Toxicol Chem. 18(11): 2557- 2564.
- Jones CG, Lawton JH, Shachak M. 1994. Organisms as ecosystem engineers. OIKOS. 69: 373-386.
- Manoukian SA, Spagnolo A, Scarcella G, Punzo E, Angelini R, et al. 2010. Effects of two offshore gas platforms on soft-bottom benthic communities (northwestern Adriatic Sea, Italy). Mar Environ Res. 70(5): 402-410.
- Mienis FH, de Stigter HC, de Haas H, van Weering TCE. 2009. Near-bed particle deposition and resuspension in a cold-water coral mound area at the Southwest Rockall Trough margin, NE Atlantic. Deep Sea Res Part I. 56(6): 1026-1038.
- Mienis FG, Duineveld GCA, Davies AJ, Ross SW, Seim H, et al. 2012. The influence of near-bed hydrodynamic conditions on cold-water corals in the Viosca Knoll area, Gulf of Mexico. Deep Sea Res Part I. 60: 32-45.
- Mienis FC, van der Land C, de Stigter HC, van de Vorstenbosch M, de Haas H, et al. 2009. Sediment accumulation on a cold-water carbonate mound at the Southwest Rockall Trough margin. Marin Geol. $265(1-2): 40-50.$
- Montagna PA, Baguley JG, Cooksey C, Hartwell I, Hyde LJ, et al. 2013. Deep-sea benthic footprint of the Deepwater Horizon blowout. PloS One 8(8).
- Montagna, PA, Baguleu JG, Cooksey C, Hyland JL. 2016. Persistent impacts to the deep soft-bottom benthos one year after the Deepwater Horizon event. Integr Environ Assess Manage. 13(2):342–351. DOI: 10.1002/ieam.1791.
- Montagna PA, Baguley JG, Hsiang C-Y, Reuscher MG. 2017. Comparison of sampling methods for deep-sea infauna. Limnol Oceanogr Methods. 15(2): 166-183.
- Montagna PA, Harper Jr DE. 1996. Benthic infaunal long-term response to offshore production platforms in the Gulf of Mexico. Can J Fish Aquat Sci. 53: 2567-2588.
- Morse JW, Beazley MJ. 2008. Organic matter in deepwater sediments of the Northern Gulf of Mexico and its relationship to the distribution of benthic organisms. Deep Sea Res Part II. 55(24-26): 2563- 2571.
- Mortensen PB, Hovland M, Brattegard T, Farestveit R. 1995. Deep water bioherms of the scleractinian coral *Lophelia pertusa* (L.) at 64° n on the Norwegian shelf: Structure and associated megafauna. Sarsia. 80(2): 145-158.
- Pearson TR, Rosenberg R. 1978. Macrobenthic succession in relation to organic enrichment and pollution in the marine environment. Oceanogr Mar Biol Ann Rev. 16: 229-311.
- Pequegnat WEB, Gallwau BJ, Pequegnat LH. 1990. Aspects of the ecology of the deep-water fauna of the Gulf of Mexico. Am Zool. 30(1): 45-64.
- Qu F, Nunnally CC, Lemanski JR, Wade TL, Amon RMW, et al. 2016. Polychaete annelid (segmented worms) abundance and species composition in the proximity (6 to 9 km) of the Deepwater Horizon (DWH) oil spill in the deep Gulf of Mexico. Deep Sea Res Part II. 129: 130-136.
- R Development Core Team. 2016. R: A language and environment for statistical computing.Vienna (AT): R Foundation for Statistical Computing.
- Ross SW, Quattrini AM. 2007. The fish fauna associated with deep coral banks off the southeastern United States. Deep Sea Res Part I. 54(6): 975-1007.
- Rowe GT, Kennicutt MC, editors, (Texas Engineering and Experiment Station, College Station, TX). 2009. Northern Gulf of Mexico continental slope habitats and benthic ecology study: Final report.

New Orleans (LA): U.S. Dept. of the Interior, Minerals Management Service, Gulf of Mexico OCS Region. Report No.: OCS Study MMS 2009-039. Contract no.: 1435-01-99-CT-30991.

- Schroeder WW. 2002. Observations of *Lophelia pertusa* and the surficial geology at a deep-water site in the northeastern Gulf of Mexico. Hydrobiol. 471(1): 29-33.
- Thurber AR, Sweetman AK, Narayanaswamy BE, Jones DOB, Ingels J, et al. 2014. Ecosystem function and services provided by the deep sea. Biogeosci. 11(14): 3941-3963.
- Tyler P.(1988. Seasonality in the deep sea. Oceanogr Mar Biol Annu Rev 26: 227-258.
- USA v. BP et al. (United States of America v. BP Exploration & Production Inc. et al.) 2015. Findings of fact and conclusions of law: Phase Two trial. In re: Oil spill by the oil rig 'Deepwater Horizon' in the Gulf of Mexico, on April 20, 2010. No. MDL 2179, 2015 WL 225421 (LA. E.D. Jan. 15, 2015. (Doc. 14021). New Orleans (LA): U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana.
- Valentine DL, Fisher GB, Bagby SC, Netslon RK, Reddy CM, et al. 2014. Fallout plume of submerged oil from Deepwater Horizon. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. 111(45): 15906-15911.
- Wei CL, Rowe GT, Fain Hubbard G, Scheltema AH, Wilson GDF, et al. 2010. Bathymetric zonation of deep-sea macrofauna in relation to export of surface phytoplankton production. Marin Ecol Prog Ser. 399: 1-14.
- White HK, Hsing P-Y, Cho W, Chank TM, Cordes EE, et al. 2012. Impact of the Deepwater Horizon oil spill on a deep-water coral community in the Gulf of Mexico. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. 109(50): 20303-20308.
- White HK, Lyons SL, Harrison SJ, Findley DM, Liu Y, et al. 2014. Long-term persistence of dispersants following the Deepwater Horizon oil spill. Environ Sci Technol Lett. 1(7): 295-299.
- Yeager KM, Santschi PH, Rowe GT. 2004. Sediment accumulation and radionuclide inventories (239,240Pu, 210Pb and 234Th) in the northern Gulf of Mexico, as influenced by organic matter and macrofaunal density. Mar Chem. 91(1–4): 1-14.

Zar JH. 1999. Biostatistical analysis. Upper Saddle River (NJ): Prentice Hall.

Appendix A: Sample Location Information

Table A-1. Parameters associated with each sediment core included in analyses

RB=NOAA Ship *Ronald H. Brown*; SJ=R/V *Seward Johnson*; HC=*Holiday Chouest*; NA=E/V *Nautilus*; AT=R/V *Atlantis*; FK=R/V *Falkor*; Gyre=R/V *Gyre*; CH=R/V *Cape Hatteras*; Jason=ROV *Jason II*; BC=Box core; JSL=HOV *Johnson Sea Link II*; Mill=ROV *Millennium*; Herc=ROV *Hercules*; Alvin=HOV *Alvin*; OI=DSV *Ocean Inspector*; GEX=ROV *Global Explorer*; Infauna=number of cores used for infaunal analyses; GC=number of cores used in environmental analyses.

Department of the Interior (DOI)

The Department of the Interior protects and manages the Nation's natural resources and cultural heritage; provides scientific and other information about those resources; and honors the Nation's trust responsibilities or special commitments to American Indians, Alaska Natives, and affiliated island communities.

Bureau of Ocean Energy Management (BOEM)

The mission of the Bureau of Ocean Energy Management is to manage development of U.S. Outer Continental Shelf energy and mineral resources in an environmentally and economically responsible way.

BOEM Environmental Studies Program

The mission of the Environmental Studies Program is to provide the information needed to predict, assess, and manage impacts from offshore energy and marine mineral exploration, development, and production activities on human, marine, and coastal environments. The proposal, selection, research, review, collaboration, production, and dissemination of each of BOEM's Environmental Studies follows the DOI Code of Scientific and Scholarly Conduct, in support of a culture of scientific and professional integrity, as set out in the DOI Departmental Manual (305 DM 3).